

1 LOUISIANA DEPARTMENT OF ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY
2 PUBLIC HEARING
3 FOR
4 BUNGE NORTH AMERICA, INC.
5 Destrehan Grain Elevator
6 and
7 Destrehan Oilseed Processing Plant

8 *****

9 This public hearing was held in connection
10 with the above captioned matter in the St.
11 Charles Parish Council Meeting Room, St. Charles
12 Parish Courthouse, 2nd Floor, Destrehan,
13 Louisiana, on Tuesday, March 24, 2009,
14 commencing at 6:04 p.m.

15 *****

16 BEFORE:

17 Tiffeny Suire Gallardo
18 Certified Court Reporter
19 In and For the State of
20 Louisiana

22 A P P E A R A N C E S

deqbu

FOR THE LOUISIANA DEPARTMENT OF ENVIRONMENTAL
QUALITY:

MS. CLAUDIA RUSH
HEARING OFFICER
P.O. BOX 4303
602 NORTH 5TH STREET
BATON ROUGE, LOUISIANA 70802

FOR BUNGE NORTH AMERICA, INC.:

MR. JERRY GIBSON
12442 RIVER ROAD
DESTREHAN, LOUISIANA 70047

ALSO PRESENT:

MS. SOUMAYA GHOSH
MR. CALVIN FAIR

3

	I N D E X	PAGE
2	APPEARANCES.	2
3	PROCEEDINGS.	4
3	PRESENTATION BY MR. GIBSON.	11
4	PUBLIC COMMENTS	16
	EXHIBITS:	
1	BUNGE PRESENTATION.	15

deqbu
serving as Hearing Officer this
evening, Tuesday, March 24, 200

This hearing is scheduled to accept public comments concerning Two (2) Proposed Initial Part 70 Air Operating Permits for Bunge North America, Inc., 12442 River Road, Destrehan, Louisiana, 70047, for their Destrehan Grain Elevator; Agency Interest No. 103295, Permit No. 2520-00048-V0, and Activity Tracking No. PER19990001; and 12466 River Road, Destrehan, Louisiana, 70047, for their Destrehan Oilseed Processing Plant; Agency Interest No. 1738, Permit No. 2520-00010-V0, and Activity Tracking No. PER19960002. The facilities are located at 12442 River Road and 12466 River Road, Destrehan,

St. Charles Parish, Louisiana.

Bunge North America, Inc. Requested
Two (2) Proposed Initial Part 70 Air
Operating Permits.

The Destrehan Grain Elevator is an exiting dry bulk grain storage and handling facility that is currently operating under State Permit No. 2520-00048-01 that was granted on March 27, 1998. They are requesting permit

11 degbu
modifications under an Initial Part 70
12 Air Operating Permit.

13 The Destrehan Oilseed Processing
14 Plant is an existing soybean oil
15 extraction plant that is currently
16 operating under State Permit No. 2520-
17 00010-02 that was issued on August 27,
18 1996. They are requesting permit
19 modifications under an Initial Part 70
20 Air Operating Permit.

21 This Hearing is not being conducted
22 in a question and answer format. Let
23 me repeat that again. This Hearing is
24 not being conducted in a question and
25 answer format. Please remember that

□

6

1 the purpose of this public hearing is
2 for LDEQ to receive your comments
3 concerning the Two (2) Proposed Initial
4 Part 70 Air Operating Permits.

5 This Hearing is to provide all
6 individuals a chance to be heard
7 regardless of their position on the two
8 (2) Proposed Permits. Courteous
9 behavior is expected of everyone at all
10 times. You may speak in support of, or
11 in opposition to these Two (2) Proposed
12 Permits; or simply to provide
13 additional information.

degbu
14 All interested persons will be
15 given a reasonable opportunity to
16 comment, unless testimony is not
17 related to the purpose of this hearing.
18 Your comments will be evaluated and
19 addressed in the Department's written
20 response.

21 A Public Notice advertising this
22 Public Hearing and Request for Public
23 Comment on the Two (2) Proposed Initial
24 Part 70 Air Operating Permits was
25 published on Thursday, February 12,

□

7

1 2009, in the St. Charles Herald-Guide,
2 Boutte, and also in The Advocate, Baton
3 Rouge, Louisiana.

4 Previous notices regarding the two
5 Permit Actions have been published on
6 Thursday, November 6, 2008, in the St.
7 Charles Herald-Guide and in The
8 Advocate in Baton Rouge.

9 Copies of the material associated
10 with the two Proposed Permits are
11 available for inspection and review at
12 the LDEQ Public Records Center, Room
13 127, 602 North 5th Street, Baton Rouge,
14 Louisiana. Viewing hours are from 8:00
15 a.m. to 4:30 p.m., Monday through
16 Friday, except on holidays.

17 deqbu
Additional copies are available for
18 review at the St. Charles Parish
19 Library, East Regional Branch, 100
20 River Oaks Drive, Destrehan, Louisiana
21 70047.

22 The available information can also
23 be accessed electronically on the
24 Electronic Document Management System
25 (EDMS) on the DEQ public website at

□

8

1 www.deq.louisiana.gov.

2 In addition, copies of the Public
3 Notice announcing this Public Hearing
4 were mailed on Tuesday, February 3,
5 2009, via the US Postal Service and via
6 e-mail to individuals who have
7 requested to be placed on the mailing
8 list maintained by the LDEQ, Office of
9 Environmental Services.

10 In accordance with the Louisiana
11 Administrative Code, Title 33, Part
12 III, Section 531.A.3.c., comments
13 received by 12:30 p.m., Monday, March
14 30, 2009, will be considered prior to a
15 final decision. All comments heard and
16 transcribed during this Hearing and all
17 written comments received by 12:30
18 p.m., Monday, March 30, 2009, shall be
19 retained by the Department and

20 degbu
considered in determining whether to
21 issue or deny the requested permits.

22 Written comments on the Two (2)
23 Proposed Initial Part 70 Air Operating
24 Permits may be submitted to Ms. Soumaya
25 Ghosn, LDEQ-OES, Environmental

□

9

1 Assistance Division, P.O. Box 4313,
2 Baton Rouge, Louisiana, 70821-4313.

3 Under Louisiana Revised Statutes
4 30:2017, as revised by the legislature
5 in the 2004 session, the Department is
6 required to follow the following order
7 of speakers, with the provision that
8 the Presiding Officer may give
9 preference to a public official to
10 speak at any time during the hearing.
11 However, any time limit set for citizen
12 testimony shall apply to public
13 officials.

14 The Department must provide up to
15 30 minutes to the permit applicant for
16 an introductory presentation.
17 Thereafter, preference for speaking up
18 to one-hour is given as follows: For
19 the first hour, to those citizens who
20 live within a two-mile radius of the
21 location of the facility. For the
22 second hour, to those citizens who work

23 degbu
within a two-mile radius of the
24 location of the facility. And for the
25 third hour, to those citizens who live

□

10

1 within the parish of the location of
2 the facility.

3 Thereafter, each hour of the
4 hearing shall alternate between those
5 who are in support of the two Proposed
6 Permits and those who are opposed to
7 them.

8 The order of speakers for tonight's
9 hearing will be based on the
10 information provided by the speakers on
11 the registration forms. Anyone who
12 registered to speak but did not provide
13 the necessary information will be given
14 the opportunity to speak. However,
15 they will be called last in the order
16 of the registration.

17 This Hearing is being transcribed;
18 therefore, each speaker should begin
19 his or her comments by stating for the
20 Record the following: They must state
21 their name, their address, and any
22 organization he or she may represent.

23 I also remind you to please turn
24 off or silence all cell phones and
25 other electronic devices at this time.

1 So at this time, I would like for
2 the permit applicant's representative
3 to come forward and make your
4 introductory presentation.

5 (PRESENTATION)

6 BY MR. JERRY GIBSON:

7 My name is Jerry Gibson. I live at
8 41 Yellowstone Drive in New Orleans,
9 Louisiana, 70131. And I am the grain
10 export facility manager at the Bunge
11 Grain terminal in 12442 River Road in
12 Destrehan.

13 I've got some slides here on
14 PowerPoint. An explanation about Bunge
15 and what we do and about this Title V
16 Permit for the grain elevator and the
17 Oilseeds Processing.

18 First of all, Bunge North America
19 is a grain operation that buys, handles
20 and processes, conditions, and stores
21 agricultural commodities by North
22 American farmers. In addition to
23 selling to domestic processors, we are
24 a leading exporter of agricultural
25 commodities. Our products include

deqbu

1 soybeans, corn, wheat, sorghum, rice,
2 canola, and other grain products.
3 Bunge exports promote a favorable
4 balance of trade for the United States.

5 Talking a little bit about Bunge in
6 Louisiana. We operate 11 interior
7 grain elevators throughout the state of
8 Louisiana, throughout seven of the
9 parishes. These facilities are
10 situated to serve more than 500
11 Louisiana farmers, buying grain
12 directly from the farmers and shipping
13 it by barge or by rail to the Destrehan
14 export facility for processing or
15 export. These other Louisiana
16 facilities employ about 54 full-time
17 employees and about an equal number of
18 part-time seasonal employees. We
19 handle up to 50 million bushels a year
20 of Louisiana corn and soybeans, milo,
21 wheat, and rice.

22 Moving on down to the river to our
23 Bunge Destrehan facility. Our export
24 elevator opened in 1961 and our soybean
25 processing plant was commissioned in

□

13

1 1968. These facilities offer dry bulk
2 storage and transfer operations
3 receiving barges and railcars from our

deqbu

4 Louisiana facilities, as well as other
5 grain, Bunge and other outside grain
6 companies facilities throughout the
7 United States. Processing soybeans,
8 producing soybean meal used by
9 primarily as animal feed and soybean
10 oil used as a food ingredient. Also,
11 the export terminal ships grain and
12 soybean and soybean products by ocean
13 vessels and barges.

14 Bunge in Destrehan. Our total
15 employment for the Destrehan site is
16 approximately 140 full-time employees
17 plus some part-time employees. Our
18 annual payroll, including payroll wages
19 and benefits for full-time employees is
20 more than \$8.8 million every year which
21 contributes significantly to the local
22 economy. Also employed at the facility
23 is several outside contractors and
24 vendors that are from the local
25 community which more than double this

□

14

1 economic impact to the community. Also
2 want to point out that Bunge Destrehan
3 pays more than \$850,000.00 annually in
4 state and local taxes.

5 Bunge's commitment to the
6 community. I think citizenship is one

deqbu

7 of Bunge's core values, striving to be
8 good neighbors. Following Hurricane
9 Katrina, Bunge contributed \$250,000.00
10 immediately into the local community
11 service organizations. Bunge
12 participates in many other charitable
13 and community activities and is a long
14 time participant in the Partners in
15 Education program at the St. Charles
16 Parish School System. Bunge and our
17 employees are longtime supporters of
18 the local United Way.

19 Moving on, talking about why we are
20 here today about the Title V permit.
21 These proceedings involve issuance of
22 the first Title V Operating permits for
23 our two facilities, the elevator and
24 the processing plant. These permits
25 are part of the Federal Clean Air Act

□

15

1 program to improve the understanding of
2 the requirements applicable to the
3 facilities, to inquire enhanced
4 monitoring, to require additional
5 testing of emission sources, and
6 require additional periodic self-
7 reporting requirements.

8 I want to point out that there is
9 no increase of throughput volume

deqbu

10 associated with these permits.
11 Emissions authorized by the permit
12 comply with Federal and State laws, and
13 Bunge is committed to complying with
14 these laws in the more comprehensive
15 permits.

16 That concludes my presentation
17 explaining a little bit about why we
18 are here and who Bunge is. Thank you.
19 I have presented a copy of this to the
20 Hearing Officer for the Record.

21 MS. RUSH:

22 Thank you. I will now begin by
23 allowing all persons who have signed up
24 to speak. Now, ladies and gentlemen,
25 we have several people here and I know

□

16

1 there is several of you who want to
2 speak, and I want to make sure than
3 everyone has an opportunity. So I'm
4 going to allow five-minute
5 presentations for everyone who comes
6 up. And, like I said, after everyone
7 is gone and you feel you need to make
8 another comment, you will be more than
9 welcome to come back up. So five
10 minutes to present the comments. So
11 anyone who needs more than those five
12 minutes will be allowed to complete his

deqbu

13 or her comments after all registered
14 speakers have had the opportunity to
15 speak.

16 The first to speak will be those
17 citizens who live within a two-mile
18 radius of the location of the facility.
19 The first person I would like to come
20 and speak is Mrs. MaryJane Abate.
21 Please state your name and your
22 address.

23 (PUBLIC COMMENTS)

24 MS. MARYJANE ABATE:

25 My name is MaryJane Abate. I live

□

17

1 at 121 Garden Street, approximately
2 five or six blocks from Bunge Grain
3 Elevator. I've lived in the area for
4 over 25 years. My son as a young child
5 played in the area, road his bike,
6 skate-boarded, roller-skated in the
7 area. I just feel that Bunge's air
8 quality right now is not sufficiently
9 decent for the humans that do live in
10 the area. I'm aware that they sell
11 products to the world. I'm glad they
12 employee people and help the farmers.
13 It's the chemicals that are the
14 problem. At 25, my son had three
15 collapsed lungs in one years time. And

deqbu

16 they were all spontaneous collapse.
17 The fourth operation is where they
18 stapled his lung to his chest cavity.
19 Yes, I just feel that the air quality
20 there already is deplorable and we
21 don't - the residence, all the people
22 of that area do not need any more
23 impacted chemicals put on their human
24 bodies. Thank you.
25 MS. RUSH:

□

18

1 Thank you. Our next speaker, I
2 believe, is Mr. James Gatch.
3 MR. JAMES GATCH:
4 My name is James Gatch. I live at
5 219 Amelia Street. I've only been here
6 for two years, but I see what all the
7 locals have been complaining about.
8 It's just like MaryJane says. I feel
9 like the air quality standards we have
10 right now is pretty deplorable. And if
11 they're not in compliance with them
12 now, what makes you think they gonna
13 comply with these two permits. That's
14 all I have to say.
15 MS. RUSH:
16 Thank you. Our next speaker is
17 Joan Gabler.
18 MS. JOAN GABLER:

deqbu

19 Hi, I'm Joan Gabler. I live at 304
20 Lorraine Street. I live within a two-
21 mile radius, probably about three
22 blocks from Bunge. I've been a
23 resident for over 26 years. I've seen
24 in the last years the air quality
25 decrease. I mean, it's become more

□

19

1 pollutant. You can drive down River
2 Road at any time and once you get about
3 two blocks away, you can see the dust
4 cloud. I am opposed to any increased
5 in air quality emissions in the area.
6 I think, number one, you need to look
7 at what's really being emitted into the
8 air today before any additional
9 pollutants are put on the neighborhood.
10 I'm doing this for myself, my family,
11 my neighbors. We do have a good
12 community. It's a close-knit community.
13 And I think our property and our
14 residence deserve good quality air now
15 without increasing it. And I'm
16 definitely opposed to any additional
17 pollutants. Thank you.

18 MS. RUSH:

19 Thank you. Our next speaker is Ms.
20 Betty Joe Bourgeois.

21 MS. BETTY JOE BOURGEOIS:

deqbu

22 I'm Betty Joe Bourgeois. I live at
23 309 Loraine Street about three blocks
24 away from Bunge. I've been there since
25 1958. I agree with everything that has

□

20

1 been said so far. And I think Bunge
2 needs to clean up their emissions that
3 they are doing now before they are
4 given a permit to emit any more
5 pollutants in the air. Thank you.

6 MS. RUSH:

7 Our next speaker is Mrs. Dolores
8 Pritchett.

9 MS. DOLORES PRITCHETT:

10 My name is Dolores Pritchett. I
11 live at 104 Loraine Street. I live
12 about two blocks from the grain
13 elevator. I've been living there 39
14 years and I'm opposed to any further
15 pollutants in the neighborhood. On
16 March 4th, I had eye surgery. Came
17 home and the neighborhood the dust was
18 so bad. A good thing I had a patch
19 over my eye or else I would of ended up
20 back in the hospital. So I'm opposed
21 to any more pollutants. The house,
22 everywhere you look is just dirt and
23 dust all over your plants, all over
24 your shrubs, everywhere. I think

deqbu

25 people need to come see what our

□

21

1 neighborhood looks like. Thank you.

2 MS. RUSH:

3 Thank you. Our next speaker is
4 Carolyn Laurent.

5 MS. CAROLYN LAURENT:

6 My name is Carolyn Laurent. I live
7 at 121 Pelican. I live within two
8 blocks of the elevator. We will be
9 soon moving from that area because of
10 the grain elevator, but I am here
11 tonight to support my neighbors. We've
12 been there 49 years and the emissions
13 that are coming out of the elevator now
14 are just so much that it's unbearable.
15 And from the permit that I'm reading,
16 all of the emissions are doubling.
17 They're asking for a double amount of
18 emissions, especially the VOC, which is
19 a volatile organic compound. And it's
20 very, very dangerous to people's
21 respiratory system. And I'm definitely
22 opposed to any additional emissions
23 from the elevator. Like I said, I'm
24 here to support my neighbors tonight.
25 Thank you.

□

1 MS. RUSH:

2 Our next speaker is Mr. Joel Maese.

3 MR. JOEL MAESE:

4 How you doing? I'm Joel Maese, 202
5 Amelia Street, Destrehan, about five or
6 six blocks from the elevator. I've
7 been there about 25 years. I like the
8 rest of my neighbors am opposed to any
9 additional grants or any kind of
10 permits to them. Despite the
11 gentlemen's assertion that they've been
12 good corporate neighbors, I'm here to
13 tell you that they've been anything but
14 good corporate neighbors. We have been
15 in a 30 or 40 year, myself 25, the lady
16 that was just here before me, almost
17 50. We've all been doing the same
18 thing. Going around and around in
19 circles, arguing with DEQ, trying to
20 get them to take care of the emission
21 problems that we already have, much
22 less have to deal with more emissions
23 for a new permit that they're trying to
24 have granted. It's not just an issue
25 of our health. It's an issue of our

□

1 safety, our property value, everything

2 deqbu
3 else that the State of Louisiana has a
4 responsibility to the neighborhood to
5 take care of us against a corporate
6 titan who has the money to do basically
7 what they want. And that's basically
8 what they've done over the years.
9 They've done basically what they want.
10 They're not afraid of DEQ. They know
11 that you don't come out and check
12 during the weekends or after 5:00
13 o'clock to check air emissions. So
14 when do they start pouring it out?
15 After 5:00 o'clock and on the weekends.
16 We've got the most beautiful white oak
17 trees. These are live oaks. They're
18 supposed to have green leaves on them.
19 If you go through my neighborhood after
20 a good dusting by the elevators, we
21 have trees that are white. Our cars,
22 regardless of what color they were from
23 the factory, end up being white. Our
24 houses, regardless of what color they
25 are painted, are white. These people
 put out emissions that are substandard

□

24

1 that are not meeting the permits they
2 already have. That needs to be looked
3 at first. That needs to be worked on.
4 DEQ needs to come up with something

5 deqbu
better to deal with the problems we are
6 already having with these people and
7 delay any kind of action on giving them
8 any kind of permits. So like the rest
9 of my neighbors said, I'm completely
10 opposed to anything that y'all are
11 willing to give them right now because
12 they don't deserve it. They're not
13 good corporate citizens. And they will
14 continue to do as they've done in the
15 last 30, 40 years of their existence.
16 Thank you.

17 MS. RUSH:

18 Thank you. Our next speaker is Ms.
19 Cecily Schwartz.

20 MS. CECILY SCHWARTZ:

21 My name is Cecily Schwartz. I live
22 at 304 Amelia Street. DEQ Air Permits
23 are complicated and require specialized
24 help, like an environmental attorney or
25 chemical engineering degree. I have

□

25

1 neither. Bunge is reducing the quality
2 of life in St. Charles Parish. I read
3 their statement of basis for their
4 permit and they are asking apparently
5 for two permits. I'm sorry that I came
6 in late. I had to work. I had to race
7 to get here. I've been living there

8 degbu
three years. I was stunned when I read
9 about the chemicals they are planning
10 to emit. PM10, they're asking for more
11 than double the emissions. They're
12 asking for two permits. I don't know
13 if that means they're going to have
14 twice as much for each permit, but
15 anyway. That particular matter, my
16 research shows it's among the most
17 harmful of all air pollutants. When
18 inhaled, these particles evade the
19 respiratory systems natural defenses
20 and lodge deep in our lungs. Sulphuric
21 Dioxide, highly corrosive. They are
22 planning to emit more than five times
23 (5X) add to the emissions. Is that for
24 each permit? I don't know. It mixes
25 with rain and becomes acid rain. This

□

26

1 is ruining our cars, our wetlands, and
2 us.
3 Nitrogen Oxide, more than five
4 times (5X) they are increasing their
5 output. Again, for each permit, I
6 don't know. Carbon monoxide, twelve
7 times (12X), VOC, Volatile organic
8 compounds, more than three times (3X)
9 each. We are breathing paint stripping
10 fumes is what we're breathing there.

11 degbu
This is why these people are here
12 tonight. We're here testifying to what
13 we see of this air pollution, but what
14 we're frightened of is that we don't
15 know what we don't see. Bunge plans to
16 emit tons of toxic air pollutants.
17 They've only published notice in
18 the St. Charles Herald-Guide with
19 has a circulation of 5,000 to 6,000
20 people. St. Charles Parish has a
21 population of more than 48,000;
22 Jefferson Parish 465,000; St. John
23 Parish, 47,000; St. James, more than
24 21,000; Orleans more than 239,000.
25 Almost a million people are going to be

□

27

1 in the blow shield from the wind of
2 these chemicals. Bunge hasn't given us
3 any answers, like how far do these
4 chemicals go. How many people are they
5 going to affect? How is this acid rain
6 going to affect our wetlands that we're
7 trying to conserve to have hurricane
8 protection?
9 I have a vegetable garden.
10 Michelle Obama just said we should all
11 have vegetable gardens to help with out
12 cost. Mine is full of dust. Am I also
13 ingesting these chemicals? I wouldn't

14 deqbu
even know the effects these chemicals
15 being emitted into the air are having
16 on the airport nearby with planes
17 trying to land full of people and lives
18 at risk. I don't know. I don't know.

19 This is a Part 70 permit. I
20 consider it a major permit. I
21 understand DEQ is treating it as not a
22 new and not a major modification of an
23 existing facility, but DEQ has not
24 asked Bunge to offer any kind of
25 environmental assessment. Bunge hasn't

□

28

1 -- and that's fine, maybe they are not
2 required to do that, but Bunge hasn't
3 even tried to offer any kind of
4 assessment of what these chemicals are
5 doing to us. I think this is showing
6 their contempt for us.

7 We know for a fact as residence
8 that neither Bunge or ADM has kept a
9 clean shop. They're not good
10 neighbors. They don't pay their
11 property damage claims caused by their
12 business fairly. They don't offer a
13 fair price. They're not offering fair
14 prices for buyouts and we don't want to
15 leave. This is our neighborhood.
16 These subdivisions were here before

17 degbu
these grain elevators. My limited
18 review shows that they have court
19 judgements against them that are going
20 unpaid. They are not good neighbors.
21 Personally, I've also experienced major
22 issues with mice, dirt, car paint
23 getting destroyed, respiratory
24 problems, constantly going on.
25 They say they want a buffer zone

□

29

1 around them and they are offering to
2 buy us out and then they go ahead and
3 put tenants in there. These are houses
4 full of toxins. They're saying that
5 they want a buffer zone, but I mean if
6 you're going to put people in houses
7 full of toxins, that's greed. That's
8 just greed. And I understand the last
9 two plant managers from each plant are
10 dead from cancer. It's not a good
11 sign.

12 When I complained to DEQ and I told
13 them that of these problems. They said
14 they are understaffed, under budget,
15 you don't have the ability to monitor
16 these plants around the clock. And as
17 someone has already testified that we
18 have issues with nights and weekends
19 with extra emissions going out. We're

20 deqbu
all aware that you can only do so much.
21 And I can understand that, but DEQ is
22 designated by the Louisiana State
23 Constitution as the Steward of
24 Louisiana's environment. You can only
25 follow the rules and regulations set

□

30

1 out by the State and the Feds. But if
2 you search through DEQ's own history
3 and their complaint history on Bunge,
4 you're going to find that right now
5 Bunge is operating out of a Federal
6 Consent Decree, which means that
7 they've committed some egregious
8 behavior and they have to follow line
9 by line. So all of us here, we need to
10 report any kind of violation we see and
11 any kind of observations and not just
12 let them slide. Bunge has asked for a
13 permit shield, but even DEQ has refused
14 to offer this permit shield, which
15 means that they're not going to provide
16 cover for Bunge's activities.

17 On June 5th, 2008, St. Charles
18 Herald-Guide, Jerry Gibson is the plant
19 manager. He said that since this is a
20 50 year old grain elevator, they were
21 unable to completely control the dust
22 emissions and now they are getting

23 ready to ^{deqbu}emit more toxins on us. I
24 don't understand how they can't control
25 dust and they are supposed to control

□

31

1 toxins. Then on December 4th, 2008, he
2 said that their emissions would not
3 change. Well, you can look at their
4 basis statement and see that it's
5 multiplying in multiples. It's not
6 just dust, it's toxic chemicals they
7 are putting out here.

8 when I walked in, I'm sorry, I
9 missed the beginning of the
10 presentation, I heard the fellow from
11 Bunge say that they pay a lot of taxes.
12 And I had in my notes that they pay no
13 taxes and I'm going to cite another
14 article from the St. Charles Herald-
15 Guide from June 19th, 2008, where Rock
16 Gisclair and the St. Charles parish
17 Assessor say that they are not paying
18 their fair share of taxes. It says,
19 "With pending court cases against Bunge
20 and others who Gisclair says aren't
21 paying their fair share of taxes, the
22 only option for parish businesses and
23 homeowners is to go and speak to State
24 Legislatures and to the Parish
25 Council." Well, here we are. We're

1 tired of it.

2 we don't know why our planning and
3 zoning commission is letting us down.
4 we don't know why our council is
5 letting us down. I don't know if
6 there's a conflict of interest between
7 Bunge and the leadership of St. Charles
8 Parish. There's no excuse. Seems like
9 there's some greed somewhere.

10 I've only lived here three years.
11 I came to St. Charles Parish because I
12 lost everything in New Orleans. I
13 lived with my mother who was 82. We
14 had 3 « feet of water, which really
15 wasn't bad. But my mother was hard
16 headed and when the storm came, Entergy
17 came and took the meter off the house
18 because Entergy said, "Hey, trust us.
19 We're your energy company." What they
20 did was they took the meter off. They
21 kept taking the \$300.00 a month out of
22 my poor mother's account. She sat in
23 that house for six months. It was
24 freezing in February, 2006. It was hot
25 as heck in May, 2006. No power. 82

deqbu

1 years old. I kept pleading with her to
2 please come. She wouldn't. I think
3 that contributed to her death. And I
4 don't want to come to St. Charles
5 Parish and walk outside my house again
6 and see my neighborhood destroyed
7 because we're at the hands of some
8 major corporation that's going to tell
9 us to wait in line, wait until they get
10 around to us. Thank you. That's it.

11 MS. RUSH:

12 would you like to make that as an
13 exhibit, your speech?

14 MS. CECILY SCHWARTZ:

15 I already spoke to Dr. Ghosn on it.
16 I'm going to write y'all a letter. I
17 also ask all these people here to write
18 a letter.

19 MS. RUSH:

20 Thank you. We finished with all
21 the citizens that live within a two-
22 mile radius. And we don't have any -

23 MR. DEORACOURT:

24 Excuse me. I live within two
25 blocks.

□

34

1 MS. RUSH:

2 I'm sorry. Please come up and
3 state your name.

deqbu

4 MR. BRYAN DEORACOURT:

5 My name is Bryan Deoracourt. I
6 live at 204 Amelia Street, which is
7 right dead center between the two grain
8 elevators. I, like the rest of my
9 neighbors, are very discouraged with
10 what's going on. It seems like they
11 are trying to give Bernie Maddoff a
12 bonus for what he did. Why would he
13 want to give these people additional
14 permits to do even worse to us. They
15 can't keep up with what they've done
16 already. Like the one man said about
17 the white trees, you don't have to go
18 over to our neighborhood. You come
19 across the bridge of a good day and you
20 see where the oak trees down here are
21 white as your blouse from the grain
22 dust. That's not acceptable. Any
23 other place in the industry, you'd be
24 setting up filter systems. You'd be
25 setting up scrubbers and cleaning out

□

35

1 the air. Not Bunge. I don't know
2 where we're good corporate - Good
3 what? Good neighbors, I can't hardly
4 believe that. That they'd have the
5 nerve to say something like that. I
6 moved out here when I was on my

deqbu

7 honeymoon about 38 years ago. When I
8 came back, my mother-in-law said, "Go
9 see if your house is still there. The
10 place blew up." It's not 50 years
11 either. It's more like 38 years. For
12 several years, I didn't have any
13 trouble with dust. Well, you know
14 what, if you could of done it right
15 back then, you can do it right now.
16 Part of the problem is that they don't
17 cover holes on the ships when they fill
18 them. The conveyor belt going across
19 the road has got big pieces of missing
20 on the sides, which lets dust go out of
21 it. We get plants growing in the
22 gutters on the house. Our cars, like
23 the man said before, everybody has a
24 white car. The stewardship that they
25 claim to be doing for the neighborhood

□

36

1 is lousy. Everyone gets runny noses
2 and coughs and everything form sucking
3 up all this dust and everything. I
4 know that there are better ways to
5 transfer this grain and getting it into
6 the ships that's supposed to be
7 covered. I've had longshoremen tell me
8 years ago when I worked on the river,
9 "We go out there and it's too easy for

deqbu

10 them to load. The man sits up there
11 with joy stick. We don't even bother
12 to cover the holes half the time. When
13 DEQ comes around, we start covering
14 them." That's part of the games that
15 they play. Thank you for your time.

16 MS. RUSH:

17 We have one last speaker, Mr. Larry
18 Cochran.

19 MR. LARRY COCHRAN:

20 would anybody else like to speak
21 before me?

22 MR. DENNIS RYAN:

23 I'd like to speak if I could. My
24 name is Dennis Ryan. I don't reside at
25 119 Amelia. I own the house and I

□

37

1 bought it for an investment property.
2 And just recently, put a paint job on
3 this house within two years. And for
4 the Record, most of these guys live
5 here and they've been going through
6 this for years, and I have never seen a
7 paint job fade the way this thing has.
8 I've already had to bleach it twice.
9 And so when these guys say they are not
10 putting emissions in the air, I've been
11 painting houses for years and I've
12 never seen a paint job fade as well as

deqbu

13 that has.
14 I can tell you right now. I meant
15 to grab my camera and take pictures of
16 the neighborhood before I came here,
17 but there are houses in the
18 neighborhood that have mold on the
19 outside of the houses. This is several
20 of them. And I can tell you, you can
21 go ride in any other neighborhood in
22 St. Rose or Destrehan and that's not
23 happening. So that ought to tell us
24 something about what's really going on
25 here. They say that they feed the

□

38

1 world with their grain. At the expense
2 of what? Hurting the people in the
3 neighborhood? I'm asking DEQ to really
4 come out and take a look in this
5 neighborhood and see what's really
6 going on. This is no joke. This is
7 people's lives we are talking about.
8 People that have been living here for
9 years. I've only been here for two,
10 three years. But I can tell you, it
11 affects me to know that these people
12 have been living here for this long and
13 have been putting up with the things
14 these guys have been doing. And you
15 don't get remorse. You don't get any

deqbu

16 remorse.
17 So I am totally opposed to this and
18 I am really asking DEQ, not only to
19 reverse this permit and not let them
20 have it, but to come out and see what's
21 going on. Bring yourselves to the
22 neighborhood because it's serious.
23 This is no joke. It's very, very
24 serious. People are getting sick.
25 People are dying. And it's affecting

□

39

1 this whole parish. So that's all I
2 have to say. Thank you.
3 MS. RUSH:
4 Mr. Cochran.
5 MR. LARRY COCHRAN:
6 Larry Cochran, 114 Oaklawn Ridge.
7 I'm the Councilman in District 5. This
8 is my District. First of all, I'd like
9 to thank DEQ for holding this public
10 meeting. The residence all wrote y'all
11 and it's very important we have this
12 meeting so y'all can understand the
13 problems. They're doubling the
14 thresholds. Right now, the community
15 is together. They want to continue to
16 live there. So we as officials, DEQ,
17 Parish Council, government need to help
18 this community where they can breathe.

deqbu

19 You heard resident after resident about
20 the air. The air quality is very poor.
21 Our parish is a very rich parish.
22 We have a lot of industry in this
23 parish. We have a nuclear plant right
24 down the road right here. We don't let
25 the nuclear particles out of their

□

40

1 gates. We have Shell. We have a lot
2 of major refineries. They have to live
3 within certain guidelines. If they
4 were emitting their product into our
5 neighborhoods, we would stop them.
6 This is the same thing. They are
7 emitting their product into our
8 neighborhoods. It needs to stop. It's
9 been going on for a number of years.
10 As I said, this community is together.
11 And they are going to continue to work
12 together.

13 And DEQ, y'all have to come into
14 the community and start taking air
15 samples and really helping us out. We
16 need help. We really do. This permit
17 cannot be allowed to go through until
18 we get a handle on what's going on
19 right now. That's all I have. Thank
20 you very much.

21 MS. RUSH:

deqbu

22 would you like to add one more
23 comment, ma'am? Just restate your name
24 for the Record.

25 MS. MARYJANE ABATE:

□

41

1 MaryJane Abate, 121 Garden Street.
2 what I wanted to add is that my son
3 when he had these collapsed lungs, they
4 were all spontaneous collapsed lungs
5 from no accident. And I did an
6 investigation myself because between
7 Bunge and St. Charles Grain Elevators,
8 there's something like six blocks and
9 three blocks back to the railroad
10 tracks. And when I investigated and
11 spoke with people because I do work as
12 a Commissioner of Election and went to
13 Church and different functions. I was
14 told that this was such a rare thing
15 for his lungs to spontaneously
16 collapse. I found four other people in
17 the area whose lungs had also
18 collapsed. One being a 14-year old
19 girl, a Trahan girl, who lived on the
20 same street as I did. Another one
21 being a woman who moved in the area,
22 but she had a very delicate health
23 situation because she feeds out of her
24 stomach. And another one being a 65

deqbu

25 year-old man whose children taught in

□

42

1 the schools in St. Charles Parish. So
2 it is truly a very serious problem.
3 And that was in that small community.
4 This rare thing happened that often.
5 Thank you.

6 MS. RUSH:

7 Is there anyone else who would like
8 an opportunity to speak at this time?
9 We're going to take a small recess.
10 It's 6:47 right now and we will re-open
11 at 7:00 o'clock. And if anyone has any
12 other comments, you will be given an
13 opportunity to speak then.

14 (RECESS TAKEN.)

15 MS. RUSH:

16 The time is 6:57 and we are re-
17 opening the public hearing. Ladies and
18 gentlemen, there was a confusion. Is
19 Murrielle Falgout here?

20 AUDIENCE MEMBER:

21 She's out right now.

22 MS. RUSH:

23 Does anyone else want to make any
24 comments on anything so they could be
25 in the Record?

□

1 AUDIENCE MEMBER:

2 I'd like y'all to have this paper.

3 MS. RUSH:

4 we'll submit this as an exhibit for
5 Ms. Falgout. Would you like to come
6 and speak?

7 MR. TERRY AUTHEMENT:

8 My name is Terry Authement. I'm
9 Councilman-at-Large, St. Charles
10 Parish. I just wanted to go on the
11 Record so that everyone at DEQ knows
12 that along with Larry Cochran and also
13 whose a Councilman of that District
14 with this particular grain elevators
15 are out, Ms. Shelly Taste, whose a
16 Councilman of District 2, I believe it
17 is. Where we have another elevator and
18 Ms. Carolyn Schexnayder, along with
19 other Council members. Over the past
20 15 months we've been in office, I think
21 we could recall approximately six
22 meetings we've had with management of
23 the different elevators. And in any of
24 those meetings, it didn't go without
25 some conversation about the dust.

□

1 And that as a local government, we

2 deqbu
3 were pleading to help the communities
4 by addressing whether there are new
5 improvements to the facilities. And I
6 think some of them have some things
7 that they are looking at, but probably
8 long overdue. And I just wanted to
9 reflect for the Record, that as the
10 local government, there has been an
11 effort to work with these groups to
12 bring some of that stuff to the table
13 as representatives and ask that those
14 things are addressed and work with the
15 community to make themselves good
16 corporate neighbors.

17 And I came from the chemical
18 industry. And just to kind of touch on
19 the philosophy in that business, it was
20 always to keep our products within
21 their containment because that was the
22 right to operate. We didn't want to
23 violate or jeopardize the right to
24 operate as an industry. So I think any
25 industry and Mr. Cochran touched on it
 a bit. If you want to maintain in your

□

45

1 community that you function and operate
2 in, the right to operate, then you need
3 to address and work towards resolve on
4 issues that are affecting your

5 deqbu
surroundings. I just wanted to go on
6 the Record with that.
7 MS. RUSH:
8 Ms. Falgout? Murrielle Falgout. I
9 apologize. I know that you wanted to
10 make some comments.
11 MS. MURRIELLE FALGOUT:
12 My name is Murrielle Falgout. I
13 don't live in Destrehan. I live in
14 Luling at 183 Lakewood Drive. And if
15 Destrehan is as bad as the grain
16 elevator in Ama, it's bad. I live
17 three miles from the grain elevator.
18 My car is navy blue, but it's white.
19 The dust in the house is either green,
20 black or grey. It seeps in the house.
21 That's how bad the dust is. You drive
22 through Ama, when they're loading and
23 you're driving through that dust, you
24 can't breathe. And you can see it in
25 the air. Now, there's trees between

□

46

1 Ama and where I live. And still the
2 dust filters through the trees. As far
3 as something else being built to the
4 Parish, I say no.' I'm opposed to
5 whatever they want to put up. Enough
6 is enough.

7 I don't understand why they don't

8 degbu
have these shoots or these troughs that
9 the grain goes down into the ship
10 that's not covered. That's where all
11 the dust is coming from. I know for
12 Ama. I don't know about Destrehan.
13 But in Ama, the whole area is white
14 when they are loading. You can see it
15 flying over the trees and all. I'm
16 three miles from that grain elevator.
17 So my concern is I have asthma,
18 emphysema, and it's hard to breathe. I
19 went to a throat doctor today because
20 something is wrong with my throat.
21 It's from the dust.

22 Also, the kids. There are two
23 schools in that area. And they're
24 inhaling this every, every day. All
25 the school kids. It's not good. So

□

47

1 why wouldn't they want to put something
2 else there when they're not taking care
3 of the things they have now.

4 Also, I have for - I don't know
5 the gentlemen's name - a company that
6 puts covers on the shoots. Are you
7 interested in this? You can have it
8 (handling document). Do you know about
9 it?

10 MR. JERRY GIBSON:

11 deqbu
 Thank you.

12 MS. MURRIELLE FALGOUT:

13 In the end, I'm just hoping they
14 cover, that some of this dust doesn't
15 filter the air and people are having
16 trouble breathing. These kids are
17 going to get sick. They're inhaling so
18 much dust, they're going to be sick, if
19 they're not sick already. Thank you.

20 MS. RUSH:

21 Did you want to submit that as an
22 exhibit, ma'am?

23 MS. MURRIELLE FALGOUT:

24 Yes.

25 MS. RUSH:

□

48

1 I believe there are a few more
2 people who want to speak. Just state
3 your name and address for the Record.

4 MS. CAROLYN SCHEXNAYDER:

5 Carolyn Schexnayder, 269
6 Schexnayder Lane, Destrehan. I'm
7 Council-at-large for St. Charles
8 Parish. I want y'all to listen to
9 everything you've heard tonight from
10 all these people. Because crossing the
11 river every day since I've had this
12 job, I see the grain. I see the dust.
13 And I think there's ways that they can

14 deqbu
be forced to make it not so dusty when
15 they're doing these jobs. I think it's
16 just not want to do it because DEQ is
17 not coming around watching. Y'all need
18 to get out and start looking more and
19 checking more. Y'all need to come out
20 on the weekends. I know everybody is
21 like we're short of people. But when
22 people complain, complain, complain,
23 they're not complaining for nothing.
24 They're complaining for a reason and
25 usually what they're saying is true.

□

49

1 Everybody just wants to pass it off.
2 These people have lived here all their
3 lives. We live here. We feel it
4 whether we live next door or three
5 miles down the road. The wind blows,
6 so wherever the wind blows, that's
7 where it goes. I want y'all to take
8 into consideration that we're losing
9 residence to this parish because of an
10 industry. And again I'm not against
11 industry. But I do believe in like
12 they said, you keep it in your
13 boundaries. You do everything you can
14 to protect the people that live here.
15 I don't want people pushed out. I
16 don't want people to have to leave

17 because ^{deqbu}it's so bad. It's like if
18 y'all would come out just once every
19 now and then and see how bad it really
20 is. They're not lying when they say
21 "white trees" because I passed the
22 other day and I was just really blown
23 aware at how white everything is and
24 it's supposed to be green. Come see
25 what they're doing now. Check on it.

□

50

1 Make sure they are up to standards now
2 before you start giving them permits to
3 release more and more and more.
4 And like I said, I'm not against
5 industry. But you got to work and live
6 around the people and help the people
7 that's in the community. You don't push
8 them out and push them away because if
9 that's the case, we'd have no people
10 living in St. Charles Parish. We'd
11 just have all industry. We'd all be
12 living in another town. So please take
13 into consideration everything they said
14 tonight because we as council get all
15 the calls for this. And I don't mind
16 taking them, but I feel my hands are
17 tied when it falls in your lap to give
18 them permit. And I haven't heard one
19 for the permits, everything has been

23 deqbu
plus the mid-river. You put all that
24 together. You can understand why we
25 cannot open our windows to sleep in the

□

52

1 cool night like tonight. I couldn't
2 sleep with my windows open. I wouldn't
3 be able to breathe. My house would be
4 white inside. I have to run air-
5 conditioners during beautiful weather
6 like right now. I'm assuming you live
7 in Baton Rouge. You're able to roll up
8 your windows, push you windows open and
9 sleep in this nice weather. We're not
10 able to do that because it's not
11 healthy air to breathe.

12 If you look at the impact area,
13 we're talking about a huge expanse of
14 our community being impacted, both
15 sides of the river. One thing I have
16 been told by the people who worked at
17 the plant. At least the wind isn't
18 blowing at you. So what does that tell
19 me? When the wind's not blowing at us,
20 then that's their green light to let it
21 go because they don't have to worry
22 about us and, hopefully, the people
23 over in Luling don't pay attention.
24 They don't know why they're car is
25 white. I'm assuming some of them do.

1 But the vast majority of them don't
2 realize just how much of an impact that
3 this facility is having on them.

4 I just reiterate what my neighbors
5 are saying. Until they can get into
6 compliance with the current permits
7 that they already have, which they
8 grossly are negligent in following
9 those permits, I can't see how in good
10 conscience, the State of Louisiana,
11 DEQ, or anybody else can double or
12 triple or whatever their emissions when
13 it's as bad as it already is. And if
14 you don't take that into consideration,
15 then you're doing the disservice to the
16 entire community, to our parish, and to
17 the State of Louisiana. Thank you.

18 MS. RUSH:

19 Thank you. Any other speakers?
20 Soumaya, could you put the address up.
21 I'm going to read this section again.
22 In accordance with the Louisiana
23 Administration Code Title 33, Part III,
24 Section 531.A.3.c, comments received by
25 12:30 p.m., Monday, March 30, 2009,

deqbu

1 will be considered prior to a final
2 decision. All comments heard and
3 transcribed during this Hearing and all
4 written comments received by 12:30
5 p.m., Monday, March 30th, 2009, shall
6 be retained by the Department and
7 considered in determining whether to
8 issue or deny the Requested permit.
9 Written comments may be submitted to
10 Ms. Soumaya Ghosn, LDEQ-OES,
11 Environmental Assistance Division, P.O.
12 Box 4313, Baton Rouge, Louisiana,
13 70821.

14 Since there are no further
15 comments, I remind you that the comment
16 period for the Two (2) Proposed Initial
17 Part 70 Air Operating permits for Bunge
18 North America, Inc., for their
19 Destrehan Grain Elevator, 12442 River
20 Road, Destrehan, Louisiana, 70047, AI
21 #103295, and also for their Destrehan
22 Oilseed Processing Plant, 12466 River
23 Road, Destrehan, Louisiana, 70047, AI
24 #1738; ends at 12:30 p.m., Monday,
25 March 30, 2009.

□

55

1 All comments received, requests for
2 notification of the final decision and
3 the transcript for the hearing are

deqbu

processed by the Public Participation Group and are available on EDMS.

The permit writer reviews all comments and uses any additional information that is appropriate to update the permitting information.

The names and addresses of all commentors, speakers, and those requesting to be notified of the final decision are added to the Public Comment Database.

A final draft of the permit and the response to the public comments are prepared and forwarded to the Office of Environmental Services Assistant Secretary for the final decision.

Upon the issuance of the permit, a letter is mailed out to all the commentors, speakers, and those who requested to be notified of the final decision. The final decision includes the appeal process, the basis of

□

56

decision, and the response to all the public comments received.

I have received a total of two (2) exhibits during this hearing.

If there are no other comments, than you for your attention and

deqbu

participation in this hearing.

Let the Record reflect that the
time is 7:13 p.m.

This Hearing is closed.

(The proceedings concluded at 7:13 p.m.)

□

57

C E R T I F I C A T E

This certification is valid only for a
transcript accompanied by my original signature
and original raised seal on this page.

That this testimony was reported by me in
the Stenomask method (voice-writing), was
prepared and transcribed by me or under my
personal direction and supervision, and is a

deqbu

10 true and correct transcript to the best of my
11 ability and understanding;

12 That I am not related to counsel or to the
13 parties herein; am not otherwise interested in
14 the outcome of this matter; and am a valid
15 member in good standing of the Louisiana State
16 Board of Examiners of Certified Shorthand
17 Reporters.

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Tiffany Suire Gallardo
Certified Court Reporter
License No. 28014

□